

Gregory Oliver, II

v.

City and County of San Francisco, et al.

Case No. C07-02460 JL

Exhibit A

to

Opposition to Motion to Relate Cases

United States District Court
For the Northern District of California

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8 GREGORY OLIVER, II,
9 Plaintiff,

10 vs.
11

12
13 CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN
14 FRANCISCO, et al.,
15 Defendants.
16

17
18 No. C 07-2460 JL
19 ORDER THAT CASES ARE NOT
20 RELATED
21 C-07-2941 PJH, Maestrini v CCSF
22 C-07-2718 WDB, Hwang v CCSF, et al.
23

24
25 The Court received Plaintiff's Administrative Motion to relate Cases pursuant to Civil
26 Local Rule 3-12 and Defendants' opposition to the motion. All parties in the *Oliver* case
27 have consented to this Court's jurisdiction as provided by 28 U.S.C. §636(c) and Civil Local
28 Rule 73.

29 Civil Local Rule 3-12(a) provides the following definition of related cases:

30 An action is related to another when:

31 (1) The actions concern substantially the same parties, property, transaction or
32 event; and

33 (2) It appears likely that there will be an unduly burdensome duplication of labor and
34 expense or conflicting results if the cases are conducted before different Judges.
35

1 The Court reviewed the moving and opposing papers and concludes that the cases
2 should not be related. They involve different plaintiffs. They involve different groups of
3 defendants. They involve entirely distinct incidents occurring over a period of nine months.
4 They involve different legal theories. One case involves allegations of false arrest and use
5 of a baton. Another involves allegations of an unlawful detention, but not an arrest, and the
6 use of physical force. Yet another involves allegations against two named officers, one who
7 is not alleged to have been involved in any other incident.

8 No judicial resources would be conserved by relating these cases. There would be
9 no undue burden on the parties or the Court if they are not related.

10 Accordingly, the motion to relate cases is denied.

11 IT IS SO ORDERED.

12 DATED: August 14, 2007

James Larson
James Larson
Chief Magistrate Judge